

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING, MAY 13, 1997

Present: R. Goodacre (Chairman)
Councillor Madoff
Nick Bawlf
Al Fry
John Coe
Melinda Seyler
Ken Johnson
Andy Godschalk
Joan Wagner

Staff: Mickey Lam
Linda Carrington

Announcements:

1. The Chairman advised that he would attend the special general meeting of the Heritage Society in Langley, B.C. in June regarding the possible removable of the present Director of the Society.

Minutes - April 15, 1997

Page 5 - 3rd paragraph - amended to read: **It was noted that Murray Miller is the design consultant assisting the owners with their redevelopment plans.**

Minutes - April 29, 1997

Page 2 - first paragraph, change 1.5' to 7.5'.

Page 4 - first paragraph, change 46 1/2" to 45 1/2".

Moved

Seconded

That the Minutes of April 15 and April 29, 1997 be adopted as amended.

Carried

May 21, 1997

Memo to: Chairman and Members, Heritage Advisory Committee

From: S. Barber, Heritage Planner

Re: **675 Battery Street** - Heritage Alteration Permit #12. Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area. Proposed exterior alterations to a building in a Heritage Conservation Area. Application of Christine Hanrahan. Zoned R-2 Two Family Dwelling District. For Recommendation to Council.

1.0 Summary

The application is for the construction of a new dormer and balcony on an existing house at the corner of Battery Street and Olympia Avenue in the Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area. Whereas this is a conservation area, Council approval is required for all exterior alterations to buildings within the area. Whereas, the design of the proposed dormer is visually incompatible with the roof form of the existing house and is not typical of dormers of period houses which typify the district, it is recommended the application be **declined**.

2.0 Recommendation

That City Council decline Heritage Alteration Permit #12 for a new dormer and balcony at 675 Battery Street on the grounds it is visually incompatible with the historic character of the Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area.

3.0 Background/Analysis The Proposal

The proposal is to construct a new dormer on the west elevation of the existing house at the corner of Battery Street and Olympia Avenue. Finishes of the proposed dormer include asphalt shingles to match existing, new french doors with trim boards to match existing and a shatter proof glazing on the balustrade to the proposed balcony. The proposed balcony is approximately 10' x 6" wide.

3.1 Existing Standards/Guidelines

The question of exterior alterations to buildings within an historic district are not adequately addressed in the British Columbia Heritage Trust Rehabilitation Principles and Guidelines. However, the Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation and Illustrated Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings from the USA states the following principle under the section, **District or Neighbourhood: The following is not recommended:**

"Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible where it destroys historic relationships within the setting."

3.2 Discussion

Analyzing the proposed dormer and balcony in terms of the above principle, it can be seen that the shape and proportion of the proposed dormer with its shallow pitched roof is visually incompatible with other dormers on houses from that period of time. It is therefore recommended the application be **declined**.

**NOTICE OF SPECIAL MEETING
CITY OF VICTORIA HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MONDAY, MAY 26, 1997**

- | | | | |
|-------|----|--|--------|
| 12:00 | 1. | Announcements | 5 Min |
| 12:05 | 2. | Minutes of Regular Meeting - May 13/97 | 5 Min |
| 12:10 | 3. | Business Arising from the Minutes | 5 Min |
| 12:15 | 4. | 675 Battery Street - Heritage Alteration Permit #12. Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area. Proposed exterior alterations to a building in a Heritage Conservation Area. Application of Christine Hanrahan. Zoned R-2 Two Family Dwelling District. For recommendation to Council. | 20 Min |
| | | Ms. Hanrahan will appear at 12:15 p.m. | |
| 12:35 | 5. | 29 Menzies Street - Heritage Alteration Permit #13. Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated house. Heritage Designation Bylaw #45. Application of Graham Hunter for Mr. & Mrs. Shaw. Zoned R-2 Two Family Dwelling District. For recommendation to Council. | 25 Min |
| | | Graham Hunter will attend at 12:35. | |
| 1:00 | 6. | 1323 Government Street - Heritage Alteration Permit #14. Old Town Heritage Conservation Area. Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Registry building. Application of Bas Smith, Architect, for FLG Holdings Ltd. Zoned CA-3C Old Town District. For recommendation to Council. | 25 Min |
| | | Bas Smith will attend at 1:00. | |
| 1:25 | 7. | New Business | |
| 1:30 | 8. | Adjournment | |

675 Battery

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF SPECIAL MEETING MAY 26, 1997

Present: R. Goodacre (Chairman)
Councillor Madoff
Nick Bawlf
Al Fry
Melinda Seyler
Daphne Van Ham
John Coe
Joan Wagner
Andy Godschalk
Ken Johnson
Andrew Rushforth

Staff: Steve Barber
Linda Carrington

Al Fry was Acting Chairman until Rick Goodacre arrived.

There were no announcements.

Minutes - May 13, 1997

Page 2 - first sentence amended to read "As Andrew Rushforth is the structural engineer for this project, he did not take part in the discussion."

Moved

Seconded

That the Minutes of May 13, 1997 be adopted as amended.

Carried

675 Battery Street - Heritage Alteration Permit #12. Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area. Proposed exterior alterations to a building in a Heritage Conservation Area. Application of Christine Hanrahan. Zoned R-2 Two Family Dwelling District. For recommendation to Council.

John Van der Wekken from Victoria Design was present.

The proposal is to construct a new balcony on an existing dormer on the west elevation of the existing house at the corner of Battery Street and Olympia Avenue. New doors are proposed as well as shatter proof glazing on the balustrade to the proposed balcony. The proposed balcony is 10'x6' wide.

Rick Goodacre arrived and took over as Chairman.

John Van der Wekken left the room.

Nick Bawlf did not vote as he lives near the subject property.

Moved

Seconded

That City Council decline Heritage Alteration Permit #12 for a new dormer and balcony at 675 Battery Street on the grounds it is visually incompatible with the historic character of the Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area.

Discussion on the motion:

- drawings inaccurate
- side windows should conform to original windows
- house has undergone major changes and another balcony is inappropriate
- balcony would face neighbour's bedroom across the street
- the sign for the existing barbershop business in the building has been somewhat problematic for immediate neighbours

Vote on the motion. Motion was defeated.

675 Battery

Further Discussion

- addition of the balcony not a major alteration
- proposed railing should match existing
- incomplete drawings

Moved

Seconded

That the application for new dormer and balcony be approved subject to the applicant submitting revised plans to the City Planning Division and that the proposed railing have square wood posts to match the existing railing on the front of the house.

Carried

John Van der Wekken returned and was advised of the motion.

29 Menzies Street - Heritage Alteration Permit #13. Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated house. Heritage Designation Bylaw #45. Application of Graham Hunter for Mr. & Mrs. Shaw. Zoned R-2 Two Family Dwelling District. For recommendation to Council.

Graham Hunter was present and outlined the proposal which is to demolish the existing garage workshop at the rear of the property and construct a new flat roof garage approximately 15'x20'. The existing wood deck on the second level at the rear of the house will be reconfigured and expanded. The deck will be accessed by a new doorway in the existing shed roof addition on the rear of the original house. The new deck will have a wood balustrade and guardrail with a 6' high tempered safety glass screen on the south elevation.

Mr. Hunter advised that the dwelling has been subdivided into a tri-plex with 2 rental suites and the owners live in the third. Additional outdoor private space is required. There will be a storage area under the deck and continuation of existing siding. A new wood door on the garage will be kept in traditional style.

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING JUNE 10, 1997

Present: John Coe (Acting Chairman)
Al Fry
Ken Johnson
Daphne Van Ham
Murray Miller
Joan Wagner
Andy Godschalk

Regrets: Councillor Madoff, Nick Bawlf, Rick Goodacre, Andrew Rushforth.

Staff: Steve Barber
Linda Carrington

Announcements:

Mr. Barber commented on the Heritage Registry building at 532 Herald Street which recently burned down, and noted that the owners and insurance company will be dealing with the matter.

Minutes - May 26, 1997

Moved **Seconded**

That the Minutes of May 26, 1997 be adopted as circulated.

Carried

Business Arising from the Minutes:

In regard to 675 Battery Street, Murray Miller commented that he had some difficulty relating to the revised drawings and the actual work taking place on the site. Mr. Barber clarified that the balcony was the issue before this committee.