

January 7, 1997

Hallmark

Memo to: Chairman and Members, Heritage Advisory Committee

From: Steve Barber, Planning and Community Services

Re: **#3 Centennial Square/McPherson Theatre** - Heritage Alteration Permit #3.
Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated building.
Heritage Designation Bylaw #286. Zoned CA-3 Central Area General
Commercial District. Application of Bob Rochelau and Proscenium Architecture
on behalf of the McPherson Foundation. For Recommendation to Council.

1.0 Summary

This application is to reinstate the original ground floor door openings on the Government Street elevation of the McPherson Theatre. Whereas, this is a Heritage Designated building, Council approval of a Heritage Alteration Permit is required. A new interior wall is also proposed to separate the lobby from the main audience chamber for acoustic and light control purposes. The details of these interior modifications will be presented to the Heritage Advisory Committee for information.

2.0 Recommendation

That pursuant to Heritage Designation Bylaw #286, City Council authorize the issuance of Heritage Alteration Permit #3 in accordance with:

1. Plans dated January 3, 1996.
2. Development meeting all bylaw requirements.
3. Final plans to be reviewed by the Heritage Advisory Committee at building permit stage.

3.0 Background/Analysis

3.1 The Proposal

The McPherson Foundation is planning to seismically upgrade the Government Street facade of the McPherson Playhouse Theatre with funding provided by a Federal Government infrastructure grant. Also planned are interior improvements including a new control booth and wall at the back of the audience chamber to provide acoustic separation and light control. It is also planned to restore the exterior ground floor by re-opening the original door entries in accordance with the building's original appearance. The entries will be modified, however, as only the central entryway will have functioning doors. The north entry will have one door which is an emergency exit from a new interior stairwell. The south entry way will feature illuminated signage display boards to advertise current productions.

3.1 The Proposal (Cont'd)

All entry ways will have terra cotta trim moldings to match the original. There is still an existing terra cotta interior trim molding on the interior lobby to serve as a model for the new exterior trim. Due to time constraints, final details of the new entry doors and sidelights were not available at the time of writing this report. Discussions with the architect indicate they are considering wood doors with detailing to match an original architectural rendering of the building. It is anticipated further details will be available at the meeting.

3.2 Existing Standards and Guidelines

The most applicable rehabilitation principle for this proposed work can be found in the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as the B.C. Heritage Trust's Rehabilitation Principles and Guidelines do not include sections on "Design for Missing Historic Features". The recommended principles under the heading, *Building Exterior Entrances and Porches*, states:

"Designing and constructing a new entrance or porch when the historic entrance or porch is completely missing. It may be a restoration based on historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building."

The B.C. Heritage Trust's Rehabilitation Principles and Guidelines states the following under the heading, *Interior Spaces, Features and Finishes*:

"An interior floor-plan, the arrangement of spaces and built-in features and applied finishes may be individually or collectively important in defining the historic character of the building. Thus, their identification, retention, protection and repair should be given prime consideration in every rehabilitation project. Caution should be exercised in pursuing any plan that would radically change character-defining spaces or obscure, damage or destroy interior features or finishes."

3.3 Discussion

The proposed reconstruction of the original 3 terra cotta framed entry ways on the Government Street elevation will significantly enhance the Government Street elevation and restore more of its original character. Although the documentation and evidence of the original details is not complete, a reasonable judgement can be made as to the type of detail required. Some photographs also reveal a terra cotta detail simulating a keystone in the centre of each terra cotta frame. The current plans do not propose to replicate this detail and perhaps this should be considered. Considerable further detail is also required on the materials and detailing of the proposed doors and sidelights.

3.3 Discussion (Cont'd)

The significant interior feature affected by the proposed separation of the lobby and audience chamber is the row of marble columns and low wall at the rear of the audience chamber. The architects are proposing to keep the new partition wall physically separate from the interior marble columns and wall so that the changes are "reversible" and do not permanently affect the marble finishes. However, the lower marble finish on the lobby interior will be permanently obscured from view. Given the constraints and need for a functional separation between the two spaces, the architects have proposed a reasonably sensitive method of resolving this problem. The proposed new partition wall will also not extend full height in order to preserve the existing ceiling trim moldings in the lobby. Lighting on top of the new wall will accent the existing lobby ceiling.

The interior renovations will also remove an existing stairway which is not architecturally significant. Also to be relocated is an existing handicapped washroom added to the lobby in the 1960's.

The proposed exterior and interior rehabilitation have been reasonably well designed given the constraints, and it is recommended the application be **approved** subject to the submission of further details.

SB/LC

NOTICE OF REGULAR MEETING
CITY OF VICTORIA HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
TUESDAY, JANUARY 14, 1997

- | | | | |
|--------------|----|---|---------|
| 12:00 | 1. | Announcements
a) Window Conference/Washington C.C.
b) Update on Heritage Legislation Workshop
c) CHC Bullet | 5 Min. |
| 12:05 | 2. | Minutes of December 10, 1996 | 5 Min. |
| 12:10 | 3. | Business Arising from the Minutes
a) 507 Government Street | 5 Min. |
| 12:15 | 4. | 648 Battery Street - Heritage Alteration Permit Application #3065. Battery Street Heritage Conservation Area #14. Addition to a Heritage Registry Building. Zoned R-2 Two Family Dwelling District. Application of Finola Fogarty, Architect, on behalf of Mr. David Harris and Ms. Claude-Pierre. (Tabled on December 10/96).
For Recommendation to Council.

Finola Fogarty will attend at 12:15 p.m. | 30 Min. |
| 12:45 | 5. | #3 Centennial Square/McPherson Theatre Heritage Alteration Permit #3. Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated building. Heritage Designation Bylaw #286. Zoned CA-3 Central Area General Commercial District. Application of Bob Rochelau and Proscenium Architecture on behalf of the McPherson Foundation. For Recommendation to Council.

Bob Rochelau, Thom Weeks (Proscenium Architecture), Barry Cole (Executive Director McPherson Foundation), Hal Kalman (Commonwealth Historic Resource Management Ltd.) will attend at 12:45 p.m. | 60 Min. |
| 1:45 | 6. | New Business
a) Separate HAC/Staff Reports to Committee of the Whole. | 5 Min. |
| 1:50 | 7. | Adjournment | |

January 7, 1997

Memo to: Chairman and Members, Heritage Advisory Committee

From: Steve Barber, Planning and Community Services

Re: #3 Centennial Square/McPherson Theatre - Heritage Alteration Permit #3.
Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated building.
Heritage Designation Bylaw #286. Zoned CA-3 Central Area General
Commercial District. Application of Bob Rochelau and Proscenium Architecture
on behalf of the McPherson Foundation. For Recommendation to Council.

1.0 Summary

This application is to reinstate the original ground floor door openings on the Government Street elevation of the McPherson Theatre. Whereas, this is a Heritage Designated building, Council approval of a Heritage Alteration Permit is required. A new interior wall is also proposed to separate the lobby from the main audience chamber for acoustic and light control purposes. The details of these interior modifications will be presented to the Heritage Advisory Committee for information.

2.0 Recommendation

That pursuant to Heritage Designation Bylaw #286, City Council authorize the issuance of Heritage Alteration Permit #3 in accordance with:

1. Plans dated January 3, 1996.
2. Development meeting all bylaw requirements.
3. Final plans to be reviewed by the Heritage Advisory Committee at building permit stage.

3.0 Background/Analysis

3.1 The Proposal

The McPherson Foundation is planning to seismically upgrade the Government Street facade of the McPherson Playhouse Theatre with funding provided by a Federal Government infrastructure grant. Also planned are interior improvements including a new control booth and wall at the back of the audience chamber to provide acoustic separation and light control. It is also planned to restore the exterior ground floor by re-opening the original door entries in accordance with the building's original appearance. The entries will be modified, however, as only the central entryway will have functioning doors. The north entry will have one door which is an emergency exit from a new interior stairwell. The south entry way will feature illuminated signage display boards to advertise current productions.

3.1 The Proposal (Cont'd)

All entry ways will have terra cotta trim moldings to match the original. There is still an existing terra cotta interior trim molding on the interior lobby to serve as a model for the new exterior trim. Due to time constraints, final details of the new entry doors and sidelights were not available at the time of writing this report. Discussions with the architect indicate they are considering wood doors with detailing to match an original architectural rendering of the building. It is anticipated further details will be available at the meeting.

3.2 Existing Standards and Guidelines

The most applicable rehabilitation principle for this proposed work can be found in the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as the B.C. Heritage Trust's Rehabilitation Principles and Guidelines do not include sections on "Design for Missing Historic Features". The recommended principles under the heading, *Building Exterior Entrances and Porches*, states:

"Designing and constructing a new entrance or porch when the historic entrance or porch is completely missing. It may be a restoration based on historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building."

The B.C. Heritage Trust's Rehabilitation Principles and Guidelines states the following under the heading, *Interior Spaces, Features and Finishes*:

"An interior floor-plan, the arrangement of spaces and built-in features and applied finishes may be individually or collectively important in defining the historic character of the building. Thus, their identification, retention, protection and repair should be given prime consideration in every rehabilitation project. Caution should be exercised in pursuing any plan that would radically change character-defining spaces or obscure, damage or destroy interior features or finishes."

3.3 Discussion

The proposed reconstruction of the original 3 terra cotta framed entry ways on the Government Street elevation will significantly enhance the Government Street elevation and restore more of its original character. Although the documentation and evidence of the original details is not complete, a reasonable judgement can be made as to the type of detail required. Some photographs also reveal a terra cotta detail simulating a keystone in the centre of each terra cotta frame. The current plans do not propose to replicate this detail and perhaps this should be considered. Considerable further detail is also required on the materials and detailing of the proposed doors and sidelights.

3.3 Discussion (Cont'd)

The significant interior feature affected by the proposed separation of the lobby and audience chamber is the row of marble columns and low wall at the rear of the audience chamber. The architects are proposing to keep the new partition wall physically separate from the interior marble columns and wall so that the changes are "reversible" and do not permanently affect the marble finishes. However, the lower marble finish on the lobby interior will be permanently obscured from view. Given the constraints and need for a functional separation between the two spaces, the architects have proposed a reasonably sensitive method of resolving this problem. The proposed new partition wall will also not extend full height in order to preserve the existing ceiling trim moldings in the lobby. Lighting on top of the new wall will accent the existing lobby ceiling.

The interior renovations will also remove an existing stairway which is not architecturally significant. Also to be relocated is an existing handicapped washroom added to the lobby in the 1960's.

The proposed exterior and interior rehabilitation have been reasonably well designed given the constraints, and it is recommended the application be **approved** subject to the submission of further details.

SB/LC

#3 Centennial Square/McPherson Theatre - Heritage Alteration Permit #3. Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated building. Heritage Designation Bylaw #286. Zoned CA-3 Central Area General Commercial District. Application of Bob Rochelau and Proscenium Architecture on behalf of the McPherson Foundation.

The following people were present:

Thom Weeks, Bruce Johnson, Hal Kalman, Bob Rochelau, Barry Cole, Larry Eastick and Donna Curtis.

Discussion on the proposal:

The existing building has the following characteristics:

- wood frame/ masonry veneer
- weak diaphragms

It is proposed to install concrete shear walls on interior (10" wall inside 20" brick wall) and connect to diaphragms on upper level

- problem with wall is openings on the ground floor
- from theatre/urban design point of view makes sense

Hal Kalman's comments:

- does one attempt to restore?
- evidence of original appearance is scant
- one photo from 1917 Times Colonist, original newspaper in Legislative Library but cannot read detail
- open transom above entry
- in 1962 - brick transom
- no idea what doors looked like
- guessing that same motif as in window upstairs and wagon wheel transom
- canopy over centre
- narrow side canopy
- concrete shear walls preclude totally opening in side entrances
- 4 doors all open in central portion

Options A, B,C

Interior wall - reversible wall, doesn't touch marble.

#3 Centennial Square

Nick Bawlf commented that although it looks busy with wagon wheels, when the canopy is installed it will make a difference and there is a similar canopy on the Belmont building.

Thom Weeks noted the 1965 masonry could be reused.

Nick Bawlf asked about the terra cotta.

Hal Kalman advised reproduction terra cotta will be used.

Thom Weeks added that a paint removal from the terra cotta was done, some paint pigment may have been absorbed.

Hal Kalman said the 2 outside windows will probably be blocked inside for shear wall

top windows - sash removed in 1964, not proposing they be reopened.

- sound transmission problem at the moment - may be covered by concrete wall

Thom Weeks - long term plan is to reinstate clear glazing and have windows part of upper lobby

Joan Wagner expressed concern regarding canopy reinstatement given it would signal it was a major entry. She would support option A.

Melinda Seyler - also support option A, but could support option B if canopies werent installed right away.

Options A&B have keystone detail.

#3 Centennial Square

Murray Miller - is the intent to rehabilitate or to restore?

Hal Kalman - audience chamber will be restored and the lobby will be rehabilitated.
- everything behind proscenium will be renovated.
- favours 1914 restoration for the exterior with a few liberties given the lack of information.

Nick Bawlf - would support option A.

Al Fry asked if the doors are inset.

Hal Kalman advised there is a 16 to 18" inset - original reveal was 24".

Rick Goodacre commented the new hard edge brick is jarring.
is there some way to illuminate columns so colonnade is not totally lost.

Bob Rochelau suggested could light the whole wall inside to reveal.

Councillor Madoff - there is a loss of drama as a result of loss of colonnade.
- lighting would illuminate the ceiling and would compensate.

Rick Goodacre - in favour of opening up to street.

Nick Bawlf commented this will improve the urban design aspect of this block which presently interrupts activity.

The applicants left.

Moved

Seconded

That pursuant to Heritage Designation Bylaw #286, City Council authorize the issuance of Heritage Alteration Permit #3 in accordance with:

1. Plans dated January 13, 1977 - Option A.
2. Development meeting all bylaw requirements.
3. Final plans to be reviewed by the Heritage Advisory Committee at building permit stage.

Carried

**CITY OF VICTORIA HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
NOTICE OF SPECIAL MEETING
TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 25, 1997
COMMITTEE ROOM #1**

PLEASE NOTE THAT COMMITTEE ROOM #1 IS BOOKED AT 2:00 P.M. SO THIS COMMITTEE MUST VACATE AT THAT TIME.

- | | | | |
|-------|----|--|---------|
| 12:00 | 1. | Announcements | 5 Min. |
| 12:05 | 2. | Minutes of February 11, 1997 | 5 Min. |
| 12:10 | 3. | Business Arising from the Minutes | 5 Min. |
| 12:15 | 4. | 619-625 Courtney Street
Heritage Alteration Permit #7.
Development Permit Application #3084.
Proposed exterior alterations to a
Heritage Registry Building. Application
of Downs Archambault Architects on
behalf of Swiftsure Developments.
Zoned CA-3C Old Town District.
For recommendation to Council.

Rob Way and Terry Goodman will attend
at 12:15 p.m. | 40 Min. |
| 12:55 | 5. | #3 Centennial Square
McPherson Theatre. Heritage Alteration
Permit #3. Heritage Designation Bylaw
#286. Proposed exterior alterations to a
Heritage Designated building. Application
of Bob Rochelau and Proscenium Architecture
on behalf of the McPherson Foundation.
For final approval of building permit.
(No written report).

Bob Rochelau will attend at 12:55. | 15 Min. |

619-625 Courtney Street

Moved

Seconded

That the application for exterior alterations to the Heritage Registry building at 619-625 Courtney Street be approved subject to:

1. The south wall being retained in situ.
2. Existing original windows being retained or replicated with appropriate glazing and materials.
3. The applicant be encouraged to retain the historical "Cusack Printing" sign on the south wall.
4. Retain the equivalent of 6 courses of brick masonry (approximately 16") along the top of the windows below the cornice belt.
5. The west wall should meet the new building so it does not appear to be a shallow facade.
6. Final plans to be reviewed by the Heritage Advisory committee at building permit stage.

Carried

The applicants returned and were advised of the motion.

#3 Centennial Square - McPherson Theatre - Heritage Alteration Permit #3. Heritage Designation Bylaw #286. Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated building. Application of Bob Rochelau and Proscenium Architecture on behalf of the McPherson Foundation. **For final approval of building permit.**

This application was reviewed by the Heritage Committee at its meeting of January 14, 1997 and the applicant was requested to return at building permit stage.

Bob Rochelau representing Proscenium Architecture was present. He advised that the finish on the building will be a reproduction of the terra cotta. There were no further questions from committee and the applicant left the room.

#3 Centennial Square

Moved

Seconded

That pursuant to Heritage Designation Bylaw #286, the City of Victoria issue the building permit in accordance with:

1. Heritage Alteration Permit #3.

Carried

The applicant was advised of the motion.

921 Government Street -Heritage Alteration Permit Application #4B.
Old Town & Chinatown Development Permit Area/Heritage Conservation Area.
Proposed exterior alterations to a Heritage Designated building. Heritage Designation Bylaw #8. Zoned CA-3C Old Town District.
Application of John Keay on behalf of Mr. Urban Meister.
(Tabled on January 28/97 and Rejected on February 11/97).

John Keay was present and illustrated revised drawings to reflect the changes including the continuation of the arch. There were no further questions from the committee and the applicant left the room.

Moved

Seconded

That pursuant to Heritage Designation Bylaw #8, City Council authorize the issuance of Heritage Alteration Permit #4B in accordance with:

1. Plans dated February 20, 1997.
2. Development meeting all bylaw requirements.
3. Final plans in accordance with plans identified above.

Carried

The applicant was advised of the motion.